Title	Discovery Sanctions (amend Code of Civil Procedure sections 2023, 2025, 2028, 2030, 2031, 2032, 2033, and 2034)
Summary	Legislation would be sponsored by the Judicial Council to amend sections of the Code of Civil Procedure on civil discovery to explicitly provide that the trial court has the authority to award sanctions in favor of a party who was forced to file a motion to compel discovery even if no opposition to the motion is filed.
Source	Civil and Small Claims Advisory Committee
Staff	Patrick O'Donnell, Committee Counsel, Office of the General Counsel, 415-865-7665, patrick.o'donnell@jud.ca.gov Dan Pone, Senior Attorney, Office of Governmental Affairs, 916-323-3121, daniel.pone@jud.ca.gov
Discussion	The discovery statutes are currently unclear whether courts have the authority to award sanctions in favor of a party who was compelled to file a motion to compel discovery when no opposition to that motion is filed. Courts appear to have such authority. But to clarify this situation, rule 341 of the California Rules of Court was adopted and became effective July 1, 2001. Even so, absent explicit statutory authority, some judges and litigants question whether the courts may award sanctions against a party who fails to file an opposition to a discovery motion. To clarify that sanctions are available in favor of the moving party in these circumstances, the Discovery Act would be amended. Specifically, Code of Civil Procedure section 2023 would be amended along the lines of rule 341 to provide that sanctions may be awarded not only against a party that unsuccessfully opposes a motion, but also one that files no opposition, withdraws opposition to a motion that is granted, or responds to a discovery request after the motion is filed. In addition, the legislation would amend each of the sections of the Discovery Act that contains the ambiguous language that has caused the uncertainty. For example, Code of Civil Procedure section 2028(d) provides: "The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to overrule an objection, unless it finds that

the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust."

This legislative proposal would provide that, after the words "unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion," the words "or fails to oppose the motion" would be added in the relevant discovery statutes. (See e.g., proposed amended C.C.P., §§ 2025(g), 2028(d), and 2030(k).)

The amended statutes would retain the concluding phrase "unless [the court] finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of sanctions unjust."

This legislation is intended to eliminate the ambiguity about the scope of the court's sanctioning authority when no opposition is filed in response to a motion to compel discovery.

A copy of the proposed amendments is attached. Comments are invited on whether the Judicial Council should sponsor this legislation.

Attachments

LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL

Code of Civil Procedure sections 2023, 2025, 2028, 2030, 2031, 2032, 2033, and 2034 would be amended to read:

1 § **2023.** 2 (a) * * *

- 3 **(b)** To the extent authorized by the section governing any particular discovery
- 4 method or any other provision of this article, the court, after notice to any affected
- 5 party, person, or attorney, and after opportunity for hearing, may impose the
- 6 following sanctions against anyone engaging in conduct that is a misuse of the
- 7 discovery process.
- 8 (1) The court may impose a monetary sanction ordering that one engaging in the
- 9 misuse of the discovery process, or any attorney advising that conduct, or both pay
- the reasonable expenses, including attorney's fees, incurred by anyone as a result
- of that conduct. The court may impose this sanction on a party who
- 12 unsuccessfully opposes a motion under this Article, files no opposition to such a
- motion, withdraws opposition to a motion that is granted, or responds to the
- 14 discovery request after the motion is filed and before it is heard. The court may
- also impose this sanction on one unsuccessfully asserting that another has engaged
- in the misuse of the discovery process, or on any attorney who advised that
- assertion, or on both. If a monetary sanction is authorized by any provision of this
- article, the court shall impose that sanction unless it finds that the one subject to
- 19 the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make
- 20 the imposition of the sanction unjust.
- 21 (2)–(5) * * *
- 22 **(c)** * * *

24 **§ 2025.**

23

- 26 (g) Any party served with a deposition notice that does not comply with
- subdivisions (b) to (f), inclusive, waives any error or irregularity unless that party
- 28 promptly serves a written objection specifying that error or irregularity at least
- 29 three calendar days prior to the date for which the deposition is scheduled, on the
- 30 party seeking to take the deposition and any other attorney or party on whom the
- 31 deposition notice was served. If an objection is made three calendar days before
- 32 the deposition date, the objecting party shall make personal service of that
- objection pursuant to Section 1011 on the party who gave notice of the deposition.
- 34 Any deposition taken after the service of a written objection shall not be used
- against the objecting party under subdivision (u) if the party did not attend the
- deposition and if the court determines that the objection was a valid one.

In addition to serving this written objection, a party may also move for an order staying the taking of the deposition and quashing the deposition notice. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of any issue presented by the motion. The taking of the deposition is stayed pending the determination of this motion.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to quash a deposition notice or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(h) * * *

(i) Before, during, or after a deposition, any party, any deponent, or any other
 affected natural person or organization may promptly move for a protective order.
 The motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a
 reasonable and good faith attempt at an information resolution of each issue
 presented by the motion.

The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party, deponent, or other natural person or organization from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, or oppression, or undue burden and expense. This protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:

(1) That the deposition not be taken at all.

28 (2) That the deposition be taken at a different time.

(3) That a video recording of the deposition testimony of a treating or consulting physician or of any expert witness, intended for possible use at trial under paragraph (4) of subdivision (u), be postponed until the moving party has had an adequate opportunity to prepare, by discovery deposition of the deponent, or other means, for cross-examination.

(4) That the deposition be taken at a place other than that specified in the deposition notice, if it is within a distance permitted by subdivision (e).

39 (5) That the deposition be taken only on certain specified terms and conditions.

(6) That the deponent's testimony be taken by written, instead or oral, examination.

1 (7) That the method of discovery be interrogatories to a party instead of an oral deposition.

3

(8) That the testimony be recorded in a manner different from that specified in the deposition notice.

5 6

7 (9) That certain matters not be inquired into.

8

(10) That the scope of the examination be limited to certain matters.

9 10

11 (11) That all or certain of the writings or tangible things designated in the deposition notice not be produced, inspected, or copied.

13

14 (12) That designated persons, other than the parties to the action and their officers 15 and counsel, be excluded from attending the deposition.

16

17 (13) That a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or 18 commercial information not be disclosed or be disclosed only to specified persons 19 or only in a specified way.

20 21

(14) That the parties simultaneously file specified documents enclosed in sealed envelopes to be opened as directed by the court.

2223

24 (15) That the deposition be sealed and thereafter opened only on order of the court.

26 27

If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the deponent provide or permit the discovery against which protection was sought on those terms and conditions that are just.

293031

32

33

3435

28

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order or fails to oppose the motion unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

36 **(j)–(m)** * * *

- 37 **(n)** The deposition officer may not suspend the taking of testimony without the stipulation of all parties present unless any party attending the deposition
- including the deponent, demands that the deposition officer suspend taking the
- 40 testimony to enable that party or deponent to move for a protective order on the
- 41 ground that that the examination is being conducted in bad faith or in a manner
- 42 that unreasonably annoys, embarrasses, or oppresses that deponent or party. This
- 43 motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable

and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion. The court, for good cause shown, may terminate the examination or may limit the scope and manner of taking the deposition as provided in subdivision (i). If the order terminates the examination, the deposition shall not thereafter be resumed, except on order of the court.

1 2

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for this protective order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(o) If a deponent fails to answer any question or to produce any document or tangible thing under the deponent's control that is specified in the deposition notice or a deposition subpoena, the party seeking discovery may move the court for an order compelling that answer or production. This motion shall be made no later than 60 days after the completion of the record of the deposition, and shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion. Notice of this motion shall be given to all parties, and to the deponent either orally at the examination, or by subsequent service in writing. If the notice of the motion is given orally, the deposition officer shall direct the deponent to attend a session of the court at the time specified in the notice. Not less than five days prior to the hearing on this motion, the moving party shall lodge with the court a certified copy of any parts of the stenographic transcript of the deposition that are relevant to the motion. If a deposition is recorded by audio or video technology, the moving party is required to lodge a certified copy of a transcript of any parts of the deposition that are relevant to the motion. If the court determines that the answer or production sought is subject to discovery, it shall order that the answer be given or the production be made on the resumption of the deposition.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel answer or production or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

If a deponent fails to obey an order entered under this subdivision, the failure may be considered a contempt of court. In addition, if the disobedient deponent is a party to the action or an officer, director, managing agent, or employee of a party, the court may make those orders that are just against the disobedient party, or against the party with whom the disobedient deponent is affiliated, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating section under Section 2023. In lieu of, or in addition to, this sanction, the court may

impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against that party deponent or against any party with whom the deponent is affiliated.

(p) * * *

1 2

(q) (1) If the deposition testimony is steno graphically recorded, the deposition officer shall send written notice to the deponent and to all parties attending the deposition when the original transcript of the testimony for each session of the deposition is available for reading, correcting, and signing, unless the deponent and the attending parties agree on the record that the reading, correcting, and signing of the transcript of the testimony will be waived or that the reading, correcting, and signing of a transcript of the testimony will take place after the entire deposition has been concluded or at some other specific time. For 30 days following each notice, unless the attending parties and the deponent agree on the record or otherwise in writing to a longer or shorter time period, the deponent may change the form or the substance of the answer to a question, and may either approve the transcript of the deposition by signing it, or refuse to approve the transcript by not signing it.

Alternatively, within this same period, the deponent may change the form or the substance of the answer to any question and may approve or refuse to approve the transcript by means of a letter to the deposition officer signed by the deponent which is mailed by certified or registered mail with return receipt requested. A copy of that letter shall be sent by first-class mail to all parties attending the deposition. For good cause shown, the court may shorten the 30-day period for making changes, approving, or refusing to approve the transcript.

The deposition officer shall indicate on the original of the transcript, if the deponent has not already done so at the office of the deposition officer, any action taken by the deponent and indicate on the original of the transcript, the deponent's approval of, or failure or refusal to approve, the transcript. The deposition officer shall also notify in writing the parties attending the deposition of any changes, which the deponent timely made in person. If the deponent fails or refuses to approve the transcript within the allotted period, the deposition shall be given the same effect as though it had been approved, subject to any changes timely made by the deponent. However, on a seasonable motion to suppress the deposition, accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion, the court may determine that the reasons given for the failure or refusal to approve the transcript require rejection of the deposition in whole or in part.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to suppress a deposition or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the

sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(2) If there is no stenographic transcription of the deposition, the deposition officer shall send written notice to the deponent and to all parties attending the deposition that the audio or video recording made by, or at the direction of, any party, is available for review, unless the deponent and all these parties agree on the record to waive the hearing or viewing of the audio or video recording of the testimony. For 30 days following this notice the deponent, either in person or by signed letter to the deposition officer, may change the substance of the answer to any question.

The deposition officer shall set forth in a writing to accompany the recording any changes made by the deponent, as well as either the deponent's signature identifying the deposition as his or her own, or a statement of the deponent's failure to supply the signature, or to contact the officer within the allotted period. When a deponent fails to contact the officer within the allotted period, or expressly refuses by a signature to identify the deposition as his or her own, the deposition shall be given the same effect as though signed. However, on a reasonable motion to suppress the deposition, accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion, the court may determine that the reasons given for the refusal to sign require rejection of the deposition in whole or in part.

 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to suppress a deposition or fails to oppose a motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(\mathbf{r})–(\mathbf{v}) * * *

§ 2028.

(a)-(c)***

(d) (1) A party who objects to the form of any question shall serve a specific objection to that question on all parties entitled to notice of the deposition within 15 days after service of the question. A party who fails to timely serve an objection to the form of a question waives it. The objecting party shall promptly move the court to sustain the objection. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the objection and motion. Unless the court has sustained that objection, the deposition officer shall propound to the deponent that question subject to that objection as to its form.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to sustain an objection or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

1 2

(2) A party who objects to any question on the ground that it calls for information that is privileged or is protected work product under Section 2018 shall serve a specific objection to that question on all parties entitled to notice of the deposition within 15 days after service of the question. A party who fails to timely serve that objection waives it. The party propounding any question to which an objection is made on those grounds may then move the court for an order overruling that objection. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts constituting a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the objection and motion. The deposition officer shall not propound to the deponent any question to which a written objection on those grounds has been served unless the court has overruled that objection.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to overrule an objection or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(e)–(g) * * *

§ 2030.

28 (a)–(d) * * *

(e) When interrogatories have been propounded, the responding party, and any other party or affected natural person or organization may promptly move for a protective order. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party or other natural person or organization from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, or oppression, or undue burden and expense. This protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:

(1) That the set of interrogatories, or particular interrogatories in the set, need not be answered.

1 (2) That, contrary to the representations made in a declaration submitted under 2 paragraph (3) of subdivision (c), the number of specially prepared interrogatories 3 is unwarranted.

4 5

(3) That the time specified in subdivision (h) to respond to the set of interrogatories, or to particular interrogatories in the set, be extended.

6 7

8 (4) That the response be made only on specified terms and conditions.

9

10 (5) That the method of discovery be an oral deposition instead of interrogatories to a party.

12 13

(6) That a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information not be disclosed or be disclosed only in a certain way.

141516

(7) That some or all of the answers to interrogatories be sealed and thereafter opened only on order of the court.

17 18 19

20

If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the party provide or permit the discovery against which protection was sought on terms and conditions that are just.

212223

24

25

26

27

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances made the imposition of the sanction unjust.

28 **(f)**-**(j)** * * *

29 (k) If a party to whom interrogatories have been directed fails to serve a timely 30 response, that party waives any right to exercise the option to produce writings under subdivision (f), as well as any objection to the interrogatories, including one 31 32 based on privilege or on the protection for work product under Section 2018. 33 However, the court, on motion, may relieve that party from this waiver on its 34 determination that (1) the party has subsequently served a response that is in 35 substantial compliance with subdivision (f), and (2) the party's failure to serve a 36 timely response was the result of mistake, inadvertence, or excusable neglect.

- The party propounding the interrogatories may move for an order compelling response to the interrogatories. The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or
- opposes a motion to compel a response to interrogatories or fails to oppose a
- 42 <u>motion</u>, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial
- 43 justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction

- 1 unjust. If a party then fails to obey an order compelling answers, the court may
- 2 make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an
- 3 evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in
- 4 addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.
- 6 (I) If the propounding party, on receipt of a response to interrogatories, deems that
- 7 (1) an answer to a particular interrogatory is evasive or incomplete, (2) an exercise
- 8 of the option to produce documents under paragraph (2) of subdivision (f) is
- 9 unwarranted or the required specification of those documents is inadequate, or (3)
- an objection to an interrogatory is without merit or too general, that party may
- move for an order compelling a further response. This motion shall be
- accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith
- attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

14

- Unless notice of this motion is given within 45 days of the service of the response, or any supplemental response, or on or before any specific later date to which the
- propounding party and the responding party have agreed in writing, the
- propounding party waives any right to compel a further response to the
- 19 interrogatories.

20

- 21 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party,
- 22 person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel a
- 23 further response to interrogatories or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that
- 24 the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other
- circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

26

- 27 If a party then fails to obey an order compelling further response to interrogatories,
- 28 the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue
- 29 sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In
- 30 lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction
- 31 under Section 2023.
- 32 (m) Without leave of court, a party may serve an amended answer to any
- 33 interrogatory that contains information subsequently discovered, inadvertently
- omitted, or mistakenly stated in the initial interrogatory. At the trial of the action,
- 35 the propounding party or any other party may use the initial answer under
- subdivision (n), and the responding party may then use the amended answer.

- 38 The party who propounded an interrogatory to which an amended answer has been
- 39 served may move for an order that the initial answer to that interrogatory be
- 40 deemed binding on the responding party for the purpose of the pending action.
- 41 This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a
- 42 reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented
- by the motion. The court shall grant this motion if it determines that (1) the initial

failure of the responding party to answer the interrogatory correctly has substantially prejudiced the party who propounded the interrogatory, (2) the responding party has failed to show substantial justification for the initial answer to that interrogatory, and (3) the prejudice to the propounding party cannot be cured either by a continuance to permit further discovery or by the use of the initial answer under subdivision (n).

7

9

10

11 12 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to deem binding an initial answer to an interrogatory or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(n) * * *

13 14 15

§ 2031.

- 16 **(a)–(e)** * * *
- (f) When an inspection of documents, tangible things or places has been
 demanded, the party to whom the demand has been directed, and any other party
 or affected person or organization, may promptly move for a protective order.
- This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

2324

25

26

27

The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party or other natural person or organization from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, or oppression, or undue burden and expense. This protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:

282930

(1) That all or some of the items or categories of items in the inspection demand need not be produced or made available at all.

32 33

31

(2) That the time specified in subdivision (i) to respond to the set of inspection demands, or to a particular item or category in the set, be extended.

34 35

(3) That the place of production be other than that specified in the inspectiondemand.

38

39 (4) That the inspection be made only on specified terms and conditions.

- 41 (5) That a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial 42 information not be disclosed, or be disclosed only to specified persons or only in a
- 43 specified way.

1 (6) That the items produced be sealed and thereafter opened only on order of the court.

If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the party to whom the demand was directed provide or permit the discovery against which protection was sought on terms and conditions that are just.

 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(g)–**(k)** * * *

(I) If a party to whom an inspection demand has been directed fails to serve a timely response to it, that party waives any objection to the demand, including one based on privilege or on the protection for work product under Section 2018. However, the court, on motion, may relieve that party from this waiver on its determination that (1) the party has subsequently served a response that is in substantial compliance with subdivision (g), and (2) the party's failure to serve a timely response was the result of mistake, inadvertence, or excusable neglect.

- The party making the demand may move for an order compelling response to the inspection demand. The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel a response to an inspection demand or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust. If a party then fails to obey the order compelling a response, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.
- **(m)** If the party demanding an inspection, on receipt of a response to an inspection demand, deems that (1) a statement of compliance with the demand is incomplete, 37 (2) a representation of inability to comply is inadequate, incomplete, or evasive, or
- 37 (2) a representation of inability to comply is inadequate, incomplete, or evasive, or
- 38 (3) an objection in the response is without merit or too general, that party may
- move for an order compelling further response to the demand. This motion (A) shall set forth specific facts showing good cause justifying the discovery sought
- shall set forth specific facts showing good cause justifying the discovery sought by the inspection demand, and (B) shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts
- showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of any issue
- 43 presented by it.

1 2

Unless notice of this motion is given within 45 days of the service of the response, or any supplemental response, or on or before any specific later date to which the demanding party and the responding party have agreed in writing, the demanding party waives any right to compel a further response to the inspection demand.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel further response to an inspection demand <u>or fails to oppose the motion</u>, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

 If a party fails to obey an order compelling further response, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.

(n) If a party filing a response to a demand for inspection under subdivision (g) thereafter fails to permit the inspection in accordance with that party's statement of compliance, the party demanding the inspection may move for an order compelling compliance.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel compliance with an inspection demand <u>or fails to oppose the motion</u>, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

 If a party then fails to obey an order compelling inspection, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to that sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.

§ 2032.

(a)–(b) * * *

(c) (1) As used in this subdivision, plaintiff includes a cross-complainant, and defendant includes a cross-defendant.

(2) In any case in which a plaintiff is seeking recovery for personal injuries, any defendant may demand one physical examination of the plaintiff, provided the examination does not include any diagnostic test or procedure that is painful, protracted, or intrusive, and is conducted at a location within 75 miles of the

residence of the examinee. A defendant may make this demand without leave of court after that defendant has been served or has appeared in the action, whichever occurs first. This demand shall specify the time, place, manner, conditions, scope, and nature of the examination, as well as the identity and the specialty, if any, of the physician who will perform the examination.

1 2

(3) A physical examination demanded under this subdivision shall be scheduled for a date that is at least 30 days after service of the demand for it unless on motion of the party demanding the examination the court has shortened this time.

(4) The defendant shall serve a copy of the demand for this physical examination on the plaintiff and on all other parties who have appeared in the action.

(5) The plaintiff to whom this demand for a physical examination has been directed shall respond to the demand by a written statement that the examinee will comply with the demand as stated, will comply with the demand as specifically modified by the plaintiff, or will refuse, for reasons specified in the response, to submit to the demanded physical examination. Within 20 days after service of the demand the plaintiff to whom the demand is directed shall serve the original of the response to it on the defendant making the demand, and a copy of the response on all other parties who have appeared in the action, unless on motion of the defendant making the demand the court has shortened the time for response, or unless on motion of the plaintiff to whom the demand has been directed, the court has extended the time for response.

(6) If a plaintiff to whom this demand for a physical examination has been directed fails to serve a timely response to it, that plaintiff waives any objection to the demand. However, the court, on motion, may relieve that plaintiff from this waiver on its determination that (A) the plaintiff has subsequently served a response that is in substantial compliance with paragraph (5), and (B) the plaintiff's failure to serve a timely response was the result of mistake, inadvertence, or excusable neglect.

The defendant may move for an order compelling response and compliance with a demand for a physical examination. The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel response and compliance with a demand for a physical examination or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

If a plaintiff then fails to obey the order compelling response and compliance, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue

sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to that sanction the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.

(7) If a defendant who has demanded a physical examination under this subdivision, on receipt of the plaintiff's response to that demand, deems that any modification of the demand, or any refusal to submit to the physical examination is unwarranted, that defendant may move for an order compelling compliance with the demand. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel compliance with a demand for a physical examination or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(8) The demand for a physical examination and the response to it shall not be filed with the court. The defendant shall retain both the original of the demand, with the original proof of service affixed to it, and the original response until six months after final disposition of the action. At that time, the original may be destroyed, unless the court, on motion of any party and for good cause shown, orders that the originals be preserved for a longer period.

(d)–**(f)** * * *

(g)(1) The attorney for the examinee or for a party producing the examinee, or that attorney's representative, shall be permitted to attend and observe any physical examination conducted for discovery purposes, and to record steno graphically or by audiotape any words spoken to or by the examinee during any phase of the examination. This observer may monitor the examination, but shall not participate in or disrupt it. If an attorney's representative is to serve as the observer, the representative shall be authorized to so act by a writing subscribed by the attorney, which identifies the representative.

 If in the judgment of the observer the examiner becomes abusive to the examinee or undertakes to engage in unauthorized diagnostic tests and procedures, the observer may suspend it to enable the party being examined or producing the examinee to make a motion for a protective order. If the observer begins to participate in or disrupt the examination, the person conducting the physical examination may suspend the examination to enable the party at whose instance it is being conducted to move for a protective order.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

1 2

If the examinee submits or authorizes access to X-rays or any area of his or her body for inspection by the examining physician, no additional X-rays of that area may be taken by the examining physical except with consent of the examinee or on order of the court for good cause shown.

(2) ****

(h) If a party submits to, or produces another for, a physical or mental examination in compliance with a demand under subdivision (c), an order of court under subdivision (d), or an agreement under subdivision (e), that party has the option of making a written demand that the party at whose instance the examination was made deliver to the demanding party (1) a copy of a detailed written report setting out the history, examinations, findings, including the results of all tests made, diagnoses, prognoses, and conclusions of the examiner, and (2) a copy of reports of all earlier examinations of the same condition of the examinee made by that or any other examiner. If this option is exercised, a copy of these reports shall be delivered within 30 days after service of the demand, or within 15 days of trial, whichever is earlier. The protection for work product under Section 2018 is waived, both for the examiner's writings and reports and to the taking of the examiner's testimony.

 If the party at whose instance the examination was made fails to make a timely delivery of the reports demanded, the demanding party may move for an order compelling their delivery. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of any issue presented by the motion.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel delivery of medical reports or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

If a party then fails to obey an order compelling delivery of demanded medical reports, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to those sanctions, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023. The court shall exclude at trial the testimony of any examiner whose report has not been provided by a party.

(i) * * *

(j) A party receiving a demand for a report under subdivision (h) is entitled at the time of compliance to receive in exchange a copy of any existing written report of any examination of the same condition by any other physician, psychologist, or licensed health care practitioner. In addition, that party is entitled to receive promptly any later report of any previous or subsequent examination of the same condition, by any physician, psychologist, or licensed health care practitioner.

1 2

If a party who has demanded and received delivery of medical reports under subdivision (h) fails to deliver existing or later reports of previous or subsequent examinations, a party who has complied with subdivision (h) may move for an order compelling delivery of medical reports. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel delivery of medical reports or fails to oppose a motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

If a party then fails to obey an order compelling delivery of medical reports, the court may make those orders that are just, including the imposition of an issue sanction, an evidence sanction, or a terminating sanction under Section 2023. In lieu of or in addition to the sanction, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023. The court shall exclude at trial the testimony of any health care practitioner whose report has not been provided by a party ordered to do so by the court.

(k) * * *

§ 2033.

(a)–(d) * * *

(e) When requests for admission have been made, the responding party may promptly move for a protective order. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, or undue burden and expense. This protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:

(1) That the set of admission requests, or particular requests in the set, need not be answered at all.

(2) That, contrary to the representations made in a declaration submitted under paragraph (3) of subdivision (c), the number of admission requests is unwarranted.

(3) That the time specified in subdivision (h) to respond to the set of admission requests, or to particular requests in the set, be extended.

10 (4) That a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information not be admitted or be admitted only in a certain way.

(5) That some or all of the answers to requests for admission be sealed and thereafter opened only on order of the court.

If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the responding party provide or permit the discovery against which protection was sought on terms and conditions that are just.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(f)-**(k)** * * *

(I) If the party requesting admissions, on receipt of a response to the requests, deems that (1) an answer to a particular request is evasive or incomplete, or (2) an objection to a particular request is without merit or too general, that party may move for an order compelling a further response. The motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

Unless notice of this motion is given within 45 days of the service of the response, or any supplemental response, or any specific later date to which the requesting party and the responding party have agreed in writing, the requesting party waives any right to compel further response to the request for admission.

 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to compel further response or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

If a party then fails to obey an order compelling further response to requests for admission, the court may order that the matters involved in the requests be deemed admitted. In lieu of or in addition to this order, the court may impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023.

(m)-(o)***

§ 2034.

- 8 (a)–(d) * * *
 - (e) A party who has been served with a demand to exchange information concerning expert trial witnesses may promptly move for a protective order. This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

 The court, for good cause shown, may make any order that justice requires to protect any party from unwarranted annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, or undue burden and expense. The protective order may include, but is not limited to, one or more of the following directions:

(1) That the demand be quashed because it was not timely served.

(2) That the date of exchange be earlier or later than that specified in the demand.

24 (3) That the exchange be made only on specified terms and conditions.

(4) That the production and exchange of any reports and writings of experts be made at a different place or at a different time than specified in the demand.

(5) That some or all of the parties be divided into sides on the basis of their identity of interest in the issues in the action, and that the designation of any experts as described in paragraph (2) of subdivision (a) be made by any side so created.

(6) That a party or a side reduce the list of employed or retained experts designated by that party or side under paragraph (2) of subdivision (a).

If the motion for a protective order is denied in whole or in part, the court may order that the parties against whom the motion is brought, provide or permit the discovery against which the protection was sought on those terms and conditions that are just.

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion for a protective

order or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the

2 sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the

3 imposition of the sanction unjust.

(f)–(h) * * *

(i) On receipt of an expert witness list from a party, any other party may take the deposition of any person on the list. The procedures for taking oral and written depositions set forth in Sections 2025, 2026, 2027, and 2028 apply to a deposition of a listed trial expert witness except as follows:

(1)–(3)***

 (4) If a party desiring to take the deposition of an expert witness under this subdivision deems that the hourly or daily fee of that expert for providing deposition testimony is unreasonable, that party may move for an order setting the compensation of that expert.

This motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion. Notice of this motion shall also be given to the expert. In any such attempt at an informal resolution, either the party or the expert shall provide the other with (A) proof of the ordinary and customary fee actually charged and received by that expert for similar services provided outside the subject litigation, (B) the total number of times the presently demanded fee has ever been charged and received by that expert, and (C) the frequency and regularity with which the presently demanded fee has been charged and received by that expert within the two-year period preceding the hearing on the motion.

In addition to any other facts or evidence, the expert or the party designating the expert shall provide, and the court's determination as to the reasonableness of the fee shall be based upon (A) proof of the ordinary and customary fee actually charged and received by that expert for similar services provided outside the subject litigation, (B) the total number of times the presently demanded fee has ever been charged and received by that expert, and (C) the frequency and regularity with which the presently demanded fee has been charged and received by that expert within the two-year period preceding the hearing on the motion. Provisions (B) and (C) shall apply to actions filed after January 1, 1994. The court may also consider the ordinary and customary fees charged by similar experts for similar services within the relevant community and any other factors the court deems necessary or appropriate to make its determination.

Upon a determination that the fee demanded by that expert is unreasonable, and based upon the evidence and factors considered, the court shall set the fee of the expert providing testimony.

1 2 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, 3 person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to set the expert witness fee or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject 4 5 to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances 6 make the imposition of the sanction unjust. (i) * * *7 8 (k) On motion of any party who has engaged in a timely exchange of expert 9 witness information, the court may grant leave to (1) augment that party's expert 10 witness list and declaration by adding the name and address of any expert witness whom that party has subsequently retained, or (2) amend that party's expert 11 12 witness declaration with respect to the general substance of the testimony that an 13 expert previously designated is expected to give. This motion shall be made 14 at a sufficient time in advance of the time limit for the completion of discovery 15 under Section 2024 to permit the deposition of any expert to whom the motion 16 relates to be taken within that time limit. However, under exceptional circumstances, the court may permit the motion to be made at a later time. This 17 18 motion shall be accompanied by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable 19 and good faith attempt at an informal resolution of each issue presented by the 20 motion. The demand, and all expert witness lists and declarations exchanged in 21 response to it, shall be lodged with the court when their contents become relevant 22 to an issue in any pending matter in the action. The court shall grant leave to 23 augment or amend an expert witness list or declaration only after taking into 24 account the extent to which the opposing party has relied on the list of expert 25 witnesses, and after determining that any party opposing the motion will not be 26 prejudiced in maintaining that party's action or defense on the merits, and that the 27 moving party either (1) would not in the exercise of reasonable diligence have 28 determined to call that expert witness or have decided to offer the different or 29 additional testimony of that expert witness, or (2) failed to determine to call 30 that expert witness, or to offer the different or additional testimony of that expert 31 witness as a result of mistake, inadvertence, surprise, or excusable neglect, 32 provided that the moving party (1) has sought leave to augment or amend 33 promptly after deciding to call the expert witness or to offer the different or 34 additional testimony, and (2) has promptly thereafter served a copy of the 35 proposed expert witness information concerning the expert or the testimony 36 described in subdivision (f) on all other parties who have appeared in the action. 37 Leave shall be conditioned on the moving party making the expert available 38 immediately for a deposition under subdivision (i), and on such other terms as may 39 be just, including, but not limited to, leave to any party opposing the motion to 40 designate additional expert witnesses or to elicit additional opinions from those

43 motion.

41

42

previously designated, a continuance of the trial for a reasonable period of time,

and the awarding of costs and litigation expenses to any party opposing the

2 The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, 3 person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to augment or amend expert witness information or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that 4 5 the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other

7 (1) On motion of any party who has failed to submit expert witness information on 8 the date specified in a demand for that exchange, the court may grant leave to 9 submit that information on a later date. This motion shall be made a sufficient 10 time in advance of the time limit for the completion of discovery under Section 11 2024 to permit the deposition of any expert to whom the motion relates to be taken 12 within that time limit. However, under exceptional circumstances, the court may permit the motion to be made at a later time. This motion shall be accompanied 13 14 by a declaration stating facts showing a reasonable and good faith attempt at an

informal resolution of each issue presented by the motion.

circumstances made the imposition of the sanction unjust.

16 17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28 29

30

31

15

1

6

The court shall grant leave to submit tardy expert witness information only after taking into account the extent to which the opposing party has relied on the absence of a list of expert witnesses, and determining that any party opposing the motion will not be prejudiced in maintaining that party's action or defense on the merits, and that the moving party (1) failed to submit that information as the result of mistake, inadvertence, surprise, or excusable neglect, (2) sought that leave promptly after learning of the mistake, inadvertence, surprise, or excusable neglect, and (3) has promptly thereafter served a copy of the proposed expert witness information described in subdivision (f) on all other parties who have appeared in the action. This order shall be conditioned on the moving party making that expert available immediately for a deposition under subdivision (i), and on such other terms as may be just, including, but not limited to, leave to any party opposing the motion to designate additional expert witnesses or to elicit additional opinions from those previously designated, a continuance of the trial for a reasonable period of time, and the awarding of costs and litigation expenses to nay party opposing the motion.

32 33 34

35

36

37 38

39

The court shall impose a monetary sanction under Section 2023 against any party, person, or attorney who unsuccessfully makes or opposes a motion to submit tardy expert witness information or fails to oppose the motion, unless it finds that the one subject to the sanction acted with substantial justification or that other circumstances make the imposition of the sanction unjust.

(m)-(n)***